Towards understanding the tropical cyclone life cycle

Roger K. Smith^{a1} and Michael T. Montgomery^b

^a Meteorological Institute, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität in Munich, Germany ^b Dept. of Meteorology, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, USA

Abstract:

Conceptual frameworks are discussed for understanding the physics of the tropical cyclone life cycle in an idealized, three-dimensional, numerical simulation in a quiescent environment. Both axisymmetric and three-dimensional frameworks are discussed, a central feature of the former being the assumption that absolute angular momentum is materially conserved above the frictional boundary layer, at least in the classical Eliassen balance formulation. Such conservation implies that vortex spin up requires radial inflow above the friction layer, while radial outflow there leads to spin down. Many of the ideas are illustrated by two simple laboratory experiments. In contrast, in the axisymmetric WISHE models, the material conservation of absolute angular momentum is disregarded in favour of assuming that the saturated moist equivalent potential vorticity is everywhere zero. This assumption limits the applicability of these models at best to a small portion of the storm's life cycle, even if one were able to justify the implicit angular momentum source thereby introduced. Analysis of a recent three-dimensional numerical simulation of the tropical cyclone life cycle unveils a causality problem with the assumptions underlying these models.

In a three-dimensional framework, the rotating-convection paradigm highlights the importance for vortex spin up of the deep, convectively-induced overturning circulation being strong enough to generate inflow above the frictional boundary layer in the presence of the ubiquitous tendency of the boundary layer to generate outflow there. When deep convection is too weak to ventilate all the mass that is converging in the boundary layer to the upper troposphere, there is net outflow above the boundary layer and the vortex weakens. This behaviour appears to be ruled out in the WISHE models by their assumption of global moist neutrality, but is a feature of the classical Eliassen model.

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

11

KEY WORDS Tropical cyclone life cycle; classical intensification models; WISHE intensification models, rotating-convection paradigm

Date: January 3, 2025; Revised ; Accepted

1 **Introduction**

Tropical cyclones are a regularly occurring natural phe-2 nomena threatening life and property in certain regions 3 of the world. Whereas forecasts of their occurrence and 4 tracks have improved significantly in the last two decades, 5 some aspects continue to prove a challenge to forecast-6 ers, such as when storms develop or decay rapidly as they 7 approach landfall. A case in point was Hurricane Otis 8 (2023) that developed rapidly when it was close to the 9 Mexican city of Acapulco and caused enormous damage 10 to that city as it crossed the coast as a Category 5 storm. 11

The general improvement of forecasts can be 12 attributed in part to an improvement in numerical forecast 13 models as well as improvements in observational capabil-14 ities, especially those linked to satellite surveillance and 15 remote sensing. The improvement of numerical forecast 16 models has come about not only from vastly improved 17 computer facilities available to forecast centres, but also 18 to advances in understanding many aspects of tropical 19 cyclone behaviour (e.g., Zhang et al. 2015; Zhu et al. 20 2021). 21

¹Correspondence to: Prof. Roger K. Smith, Meteorological Institute, Ludwig-Maximilians University of Munich, Theresienstr. 37, 80333 Munich. E-mail: roger.smith@lmu.de

In this short essay we review some of the key the-22 oretical advances that have taken place in the last few 23 decades and go on to identify areas where more research 24 is called for. One particular aim is to assess the applicability of two old, but still prominent axisymmetric the-26 ories (Section 2) to understand the tropical cyclone life 27 cycle. A further aim is to review a more recent paradigm 28 29 that we have developed (Smith and Montgomery 2023, Chapter 11). This paradigm appears to be a useful frame-30 work for understanding both axisymmetric and asymmet-31 ric aspects of vortex evolution. 32

2 Axisymmetric models

Although tropical cyclones only become approximately axisymmetric as they mature, and only then in their inner core region (Smith and Montgomery 2023, Chapter 4), axisymmetric models would seem to be a good place to start in trying to understand their dynamics. Here we review two such models: what we shall call the classical model that emerges from the work of Willoughby (1979), Shapiro and Willoughby (1982), and Schubert and Hack (1982, 1983); and what we will refer to as the WISHE models that are based on the work of Emanuel (1989, 1995, 1997, 2012). In a recent paper, Smith et al. (2024)

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

113

114

121

122

sought to relate the dynamics of these theories, but found 75 45

some fundamental differences in the two formulations. 46

These differences are discussed in Section 2.5. 47

2.1 Material conservation of M 48



Figure 1. Illustration of the amplification of the tangential velocity in an axisymmetric vortex as a result of radial inflow and the conservation of M. See text for further discussion.

A key concept for understanding the spin up of 49 an axisymmetric vortex is the material conservation of 50 the absolute angular momentum, M, above the frictional 51 boundary layer. The quantity is defined in terms of the 52 tangential velocity, v, the radius from the rotation axis, r, 53 101 and the Coriolis parameter f, assumed to be constant¹ by 54 102 the relationship 55

$$M = rv + \frac{1}{2}fr^2.$$
 (1) 103

Referring to an air parcel moving in an inward-spiralling 56 path where there is no frictional stress in the tangential 57 104 direction, the material conservation of M for that parcel 105 58 implies that the tangential wind speed will increase (Fig-59 ure 1). Conversely, if the parcel were spiralling outwards, 60 the tangential wind speed will decrease, possibly chang-61 ing sign if the radial displacement is large enough. We 62 106 may conclude that spin up of the tangential wind requires 63 107 radial inflow and that radial outflow leads to spin down. 64 108 The material conservation of M follows directly from the 65 109 tangential momentum equation when there are no fric-66 110 tional or sub-grid scale forces in the azimuthal direction 67 111 (see Smith and Montgomery 2023, Section 5.6). 68 112

2.2 Two insightful laboratory experiments 69

115 In general, there are two fundamental requirements for 70 116 vortex amplification: a source of rotation and some forc-71 117 ing mechanism to concentrate the rotation. The interplay 118 72 between the strength of the forcing and that of rotation 119 73

can be illustrated by the first of two elementary fluid 120 74

Copyright © 2025 Meteorological Institute

experiments. These experiments, shown in Fig. 2, are useful for illustrating two important elements of understand-76 ing tropical cyclone evolution: the roles of deep convec-77 tion and the frictional boundary layer. 78

2.2.1 The role of convection 79

In the first experiment, due to Turner and Lilly (1963), a vortex is produced in water contained in a rotating cylinder by releasing bubbles from a thin tube along the upper part of the rotation axis. As the bubbles rise, they exert a drag on the water which forces an overturning circulation with radial inflow below the bubbling tube and radial outflow above. The drag exerted by the bubbles is analogous to the effect of cloud buoyancy in the atmosphere.

Except in a shallow boundary layer near the lower boundary, converging rings of water conserve their absolute angular momentum and consequently spin faster as they are drawn inwards toward the axis of rotation. The ultimate degree of amplification of the angular velocity depends on how far rings of fluid can be drawn inwards by the overturning circulation produced by the rising bubbles. This inward displacement increases with the bubbling rate, but decreases with increasing background rotation rate.

If the forcing is sufficiently large for a given rotation rate, rings of fluid may be drawn in to relatively small radii before the sum C of the centrifugal force per unit mass

$$CEN = \frac{v^2}{r}$$
(2)

and Coriolis force per unit mass

$$COR = 2\Omega v \tag{3}$$

opposing the inward motion balance the radial pressure gradient force per unit mass

$$PGF = -\frac{1}{\rho} \frac{\partial p}{\partial r}$$
(4)

induced by the bubbles. It is this pressure gradient force that drives the rings of fluid inwards (middle panel of Fig. 2). Again, v is the azimuthal velocity component and ris the radius from the rotation axis. In addition, f, now equal to 2Ω , is twice the background rotation rate of the cylinder, p is the pressure and ρ is the density of water.

If the forcing is comparatively weak, or if the rotation rate is sufficiently strong, a balance of the radial forces may be achieved before the radial displacement of a fluid parcel is very large, so that a significant amplification of the background rotation will not be attained. Clearly, if there is no background rotation, there will be no amplification, and if the background rotation is very weak, the centrifugal and/or Coriolis forces never become large enough to balance the radial pressure gradient, except possibly at large radii from the source of bubbles. This reasoning points to the existence of an optimum

¹If f were not constant, the flow could not be axisymmetric.



Figure 2. Left: Schematic of flow configuration in the Turner and Lilly experiment. The right side indicates the principal forces per unit mass acting on an air parcel in the radial direction: an inward-directed pressure gradient force, $-(1/\rho)(\partial p/\partial r)$, and an outward force C, the radial component of generalized Coriolis force, which is the sum of the centrifugal force (v^2/r) and Coriolis force $(2\Omega v)$. Right: The tea-leaves experiment showing the effects of frictionally-driven inflow near the bottom after the water has been stirred to produce rotation. This inflow carries tea leaves to form a neat pile near the axis of rotation.

182

123forcing strength to produce the maximum amplification154124of the tangential velocity for a given strength of back-155125ground rotation, or an optimum background rotation rate156126for a given forcing strength as eloquently articulated by157127Morton (1966). These ideas were demonstrated in related158128numerical experiments in the context of thermally-driven159129vortices by Smith and Leslie (1976).160

The foregoing arguments emphasize the unbalanced ¹⁶¹ 130 wind adjustment from the instant that the bubbling is 162 131 turned on, in contrast to the more gradual adjustments that 163 132 occur typically in tropical cyclones. In fact, the bubbling ¹⁶⁴ 133 experiment was originally conceived as one for demon-165 134 strating how a tornado vortex might descend from a cloud ¹⁶⁶ 135 (Morton 1966). Nevertheless, if the container is relatively ¹⁶⁷ 136 wide and shallow and the bubbles are generated over the ¹⁶⁸ 137 layer from a ring of tubes, the experiment should be rel-169 138 evant to understanding tropical cyclones also, especially ¹⁷⁰ 139 when a vortex has become established at the surface. In ¹⁷¹ 140 particular, as discussed later, the experiment allows one 172 141 to consider the evolution of the vortex when the bubbling 173 142 174 rate is slowly varied, analogous to changes in convective 143 175 activity in a real storm. 144

When a concentrated vortex has formed and the extended to the lower boundary, frictional effects become from the important. These may be illustrated by a second experiment that can be easily carried out in the home (right panel of Fig. 2).

150 **2.2.2** The frictional boundary layer

The classical spin down problem for a vortex considers 183 the evolution of an axisymmetric vortex above a rigid 184 boundary normal to the axis of rotation. The spin down 185 is primarily a result of the tangential component of generalized Coriolis force per unit mass, -u(v/r + f), which depends on the secondary circulation induced by friction above the boundary layer. The direct effect of the frictional diffusion of tangential momentum *to* the surface with frictional drag *at* the surface are of secondary importance to the spin down in the parameter regimes relevant to tropical cyclones.

One can demonstrate the frictionally-driven inflow simply by placing tea leaves in a water container and vigorously stirring the water to set it in rotation. After a short time, the tea leaves congregate in a neat pile at the bottom of the container near the axis, as shown in right panel of Fig. 2. They are swept there by the inflow in the friction layer. Slowly, the rotation in the container declines because the inflow towards the rotation axis in the friction layer has to be accompanied by radiallyoutward motion in the vortex above this layer in order to satisfy mass continuity.

The depth of the friction layer depends on the viscosity of the water and the rotation rate of the water and is typically only on the order of a millimeter or two in this experiment. Because the water is rotating about the vertical axis, it possesses angular momentum about this axis. Here, because the container, itself, is not rotating, angular momentum, M, is defined as the product of the tangential flow speed and the radius.

2.2.3 Insights from these laboratory experiments

In conjunction with the tea-leaves experiment, the Turner-Lilly bubbling experiment helps illustrate an important aspect of tropical cyclone behaviour when tropical cyclones approach maturity and deep convection



Figure 3. Schematic of the axisymmetric balance equations for tropical cyclone intensification. The equations in red are the ones used in a prognostic theory. See text for discussion.

238

becomes progressively unable to ventilate all the air that 222 186 is converging in the frictional boundary layer (see Sec- 223 187 tion 3.1). This scenario may be imagined in the context 224 188 of the bubbling experiment. When a steady-state vortex 225 189 had emerged in that experiment, the deep overturning cir- 226 190 culation produced by the drag of the rising bubbles will 191 227 be fed by the water converging in the frictional bound-228 192 ary layer. Imagine then what happens if the bubbling rate 229 193 is slowly reduced. In that case, the divergence induced 230 194 by the boundary layer above the boundary layer will be 195 stronger than the bubbling-induced circulation can sup-196 port, leading to net outflow above the boundary layer 197 231 and vortex spin down there on account of the material 198 conservation of M. We can imagine the formation of a 199 232 weaker and broader vortex to emerge if the bubbling rate 200 233 becomes steady at a lower rate than before. An analogous 201 234 behaviour is found during the tropical cyclone life cycle 202 235 as discussed in Section 4. 203 236

204 2.3 The classical balance model

239 The classical model for tropical cyclone intensifica-205 tion is built on the seminal studies of the thermally or 206 241 frictionally-controlled meridional circulation in a circu-207 242 lar vortex and of frontal circulations by Eliassen (1951, 208 243 1962). Similar formulations for the diagnosis and evolu-209 tion of the balanced tangential and overturning circulation 244 210 245 of an idealized axisymmetric tropical cyclone were devel-211 oped by Willoughby (1979), Shapiro and Willoughby 246 212 (1982), Schubert and Hack (1982, 1983) and Schubert 247 213 and Alworth (1982). The underlying premise of these ²⁴⁸ 214 215 classical models, supported by a scale analysis of the ²⁴⁹ governing equations, is that the cyclone remains in hydro-²⁵⁰ 216 static and gradient wind balance as it evolves. With this ²⁵¹ 217 assumption, one obtains a linear second-order partial dif- 252 218 ferential equation for the streamfunction of the overturn-219 ing circulation, forced by prescribed heat and tangen-220

tial momentum sources. Without such a circulation, these

sources would act immediately to destroy balance. The equation is commonly referred to as the *Eliassen equation*². The axisymmetric equations underlying the classical model formulations as well a supporting scale analysis are detailed in Smith and Montgomery (2023) (Chapters 5, 8 and Sections 16.1.8 and 16.1.9) and summarized schematically in Fig. 3. In essence, the classical models are incorporated in the cooperative intensification theory of Ooyama (1982).

2.3.1 The axisymmetric balance equations

The axisymmetric balance model is based on the momentum equations for the radial, u, vertical, w, and tangential, v, velocity components, a thermodynamic equation for the potential temperature³, θ , an equation of state, and a mass continuity equation for the transverse circulation. The radial and vertical momentum equations are approximated by gradient wind balance and hydrostatic balance, respectively, as justified by a scale analysis. Elimination of the pressure from these two balance equations gives *the thermal wind equation*, which is a diagnostic equation relating the vertical gradient of tangential wind to the radial gradient of potential temperature.

Differentiation of the thermal wind equation partially with respect to time and eliminating the time derivatives using the tangential momentum equation and potential temperature equation gives a diagnostic equation for the transverse, overturning circulation involving u and w. Finally, using the mass continuity equation to introduce a streamfunction, ψ , for the transverse circulation, one ends up with the Eliassen equation, a linear, second-order partial differential equation for ψ at any given time.

²Sometimes referred to also as the Sawyer-Eliassen equation. ³In actual fact, the inverse of the potential temperature is used.

308

309

321

The reduced set of balance equations, coloured red 291 in Fig. 3, form a prognostic dynamical system that may 292 be solved as follows (Smith et al. 2018): 293

- 294 • Given an initial tangential wind profile as a function 295 256 of r and z and a sounding of pressure and temper-257 296 ature at some large radius, one can use the thermal 258 wind equation to determine the pressure field (the 259 297 characteristics of this first-order partial differential 260 equation are just the isobars) and the balanced den-298 261 sity and potential temperature fields at the initial 262 290 time; 263 300
- Then, given some distribution of diabatic heating 301 and friction, one can solve the Eliassen equation for $\psi(r, z)$, from which the radial and vertical velocity 303 components can be obtained; 304
- Finally, the tangential momentum equation can be 305 applied to advance the solution in time, and so on. 306

270 2.3.2 Some solutions: inviscid case

The solution character in a typical prognostic calculation 271 of the classical balance theory is exemplified by the 272 flow configuration in Fig. 4. In this case, the flow is 273 taken to be inviscid and the distribution of diabatic 274 heating rate, $\dot{\theta}$, is prescribed relative to M-surfaces that 275 slope outwards with height and, for an inertially stable 276 vortex, M increases with radius, Typical distributions of 277 θ associated with deep convection have a maximum in 278 the low to middle troposphere, well above the top of 279 the boundary layer (Montgomery et al. 2006, Fig. 6d; 280 Bui et al. 2009, Fig. 3a,c; Smith et al. 2014, Fig. 7a,b; 28 Crnivec et al. 2015, Fig. 6a-c). A key feature to note is the 282 structure of the overturning circulation with inflow in the 283 lower troposphere and outflow in the upper troposphere. 284 The ascent region is confined to the region of heating 285 with the maximum ascent close to the level of maximum 286 diabatic heating rate. 287



Figure 4. Radius-height cross sections of M surfaces (black ³¹⁶ curves) superimposed on the streamlines of the secondary circulation, ψ , (blue curves) and diabatic heating rate, $\dot{\theta}$ (shaded), but no ³¹⁸ friction in the calculation described in the text. From Smith et al. ³¹⁹ (2018). ³²⁰

Note that the streamlines generally cross the M- 322 surfaces in the lower troposphere in the direction of 323 diminishing M. Thus, invoking the principle of material 324

conservation of absolute angular momentum, M (Section 2.1), the M-surfaces will be advected inwards there and the tangential velocity will increase. In the upper troposphere, the M-surfaces will be advected outwards and the tangential velocity will decrease and eventually reverse direction to become anticyclonic.

2.3.3 Some solutions: friction only case

An example of the friction only case is shown in Fig. 5. In this case, the parametrerized frictional forcing in the Eliassen equation is specified in a shallow surface-based layer on the order of a kilometre deep. In response, there is radial inflow in the friction layer and radial outflow just above it. As in the tea-leaves experiment in Fig. 2, the radial outflow advects *M*-surfaces outwards leading to a progressive spin down of the tangential velocity in the outflow layer. In contrast to the situation in the tealeaves experiment, the outflow is vertically confined to a relatively shallow layer on account of the static stability of the flow.



Figure 5. Radius-height cross sections of M-surfaces (black curves) superimposed on the contours of radial velocity, u (shaded) and tangential velocity, v (blue curves) at the initial time in the calculation with friction, but no diabatic heating, described in the text. At later times, the pattern retains a similar structure, but with the location of maximum v becoming elevated and both flow components weakening. For further details, see Smith et al. (2018), Section 2d.

2.3.4 Some solutions: heating and friction case

Combining the heating only and friction only cases discussed above, it is easy to see what to expect in the case with friction and heating. Note that the Eliassen equation is linear so that the separate effects of heating and friction on the secondary circulation, ψ , are addditive. Friction has the persistent effect to advect the *M*surfaces outwards above the boundary layer leading to spin down. Clearly, for the tangential wind speed to spin up, the diabatic heating rate and its spatial distribution must be strong enough to reverse the frictionally-driven outflow, thereby enabling the *M*-surfaces to be advected inwards. In the balance model, the boundary layer spin-up enhancement mechanism, described by Smith and Montgomery 2023, Section 2.3.4, does not operate.

392

393

394

359

369

374

325 **2.4 Summary**

In summary, the classical intensification models capture 378 many observed features of an intensifying storm. 379

- They capture inflow in the lower troposphere and ³⁸¹ outflow in the upper troposphere; ³⁸²
- They capture ascent in the region of heating, with ³⁸³ a vertical velocity maximum in the middle troposphere; ³⁸⁵
- They capture the spin up of the vortex in the lower ³⁸⁶ troposphere;
- They capture the formation of an anticyclone in the upper troposphere;
- If the diabatic heating is too weak, they show shallow outflow above the friction layer and spin down.
 This behaviour is analogous to vortex spin down in the Turner-Lilly bubbling experiment when the bubbling rate is reduced (see Section 2.2.3).

These models are clearly useful for understanding 342 important aspects of how storms intensify and decay. 343 However, they do not provide a physically closed theory 344 because of the need to specify the diabatic heating rate 345 associated with deep convection as a function of space 346 and time. Moist processes are implicit in this specifica-347 tion, which is a clear limitation of the models' applica-348 bility to more realistic situations. This limitation notwith-349 standing, if the diabatic heating rate distribution can be 350 deduced from observations or numerical solutions, the 351 models may be used in a diagnostic sense to estimate the 352 tendencies of the balance flow. 353

Ideally, moist processes should be considered explicitly as part of the problem. A recent attempt to do this within a balance framework was unsuccessful, although it did highlight two important findings (Smith et al. 2024).

1. As soon as convective instability occurs in the 360 model, the Eliassen equation becomes non-elliptic and 361 cannot be solved without some ad hoc procedure to 362 "regularize" the equation in these regions (e.g., Bui et al. 363 2009, Wang and Smith 2019, Montgomery and Persing 364 2020, Wang et al. 2021). However, such "regularization" 365 leads to moist neutral ascent, removing the capability 366 of the diabatic heating distribution to draw M-surfaces 367 inwards above the boundary layer. 368

2. The only way to remove this limitation is to apply a suitable parameterization of deep convection that does produce inflow above the boundary layer, allowing the *M*-surfaces to be drawn inwards there.

An effort to develop a physically closed theory is examined in the next section.

377 2.5 WISHE models

The flow configuration of the axisymmetric WISHE models referred to in Section 2 is summarized in Fig. 6. The overturning circulation is inwards only in a shallow friction layer and it is upwards and outwards above the friction layer. The key assumption is that the *M*-surfaces are congruent with those of saturation equivalent potential temperature θ_e^* so that the saturation moist potential vorticity, say P_m , is everywhere zero⁴. The mathematical definition of P_m is

$$P_m = \frac{\boldsymbol{\omega}_a \cdot \nabla \theta_e^*}{\rho} \tag{5}$$

where ω_a denotes the absolute vorticity in the traditional formulation (i.e., $\omega_a = f\hat{\mathbf{k}} + \nabla \wedge \mathbf{u}$ and $\hat{\mathbf{k}}$ the vertical unit vector), ρ is the density and \mathbf{u} is the relative velocity field vector⁵. It is assumed further that θ_e^* , is equal the subcloud layer equivalent potential temperature, θ_e , where an air parcel emerges from the boundary layer.



Figure 6. The WISHE view of tropical cyclone physics according to Emanuel (2000). The dashed lines indicate surfaces of constant saturation equivalent potential temperature θ_e^* , a quantity that is tied to the subcloud layer equivalent potential temperature, θ_e . Emanuel notes that "the core is warm because surface fluxes have increased θ_e there. The rate of intensification is limited by the surface fluxes, not by the convection, which is very fast by comparison. Intensification stops when the frictionally-induced radial advection of low θ_e air balances the surface enthalpy flux." Reproduced with permission of Academic Press.

Significantly, the flow indicated in Fig. 6 is radially outward above the friction layer, as in the classical model

⁴It may be worth noting that the assumption that P_m is everywhere zero implies that the moist Eliassen equation is not elliptic. This condition implies also moist neutrality in the sense that a small air parcel displacement along an M-surface is neutral. ⁵ P_m may be expressed equivalently as

$$P_m = \frac{\mathbf{\hat{j}}}{r\rho} \cdot \nabla \theta_e^* \wedge \nabla M \tag{6}$$

with $\hat{\mathbf{j}}$ denoting the unit vector in the azimuthal direction.

447

448

466

469

473

with friction only: see e.g., Fig. 5. With this flow configu- 438 395 ration, the vortex in the classical model spins down as M_{439} 396 surfaces are carried outwards above the boundary layer. 440 397 Moreover, the maximum vertical velocity w_{max} is at the 441 398 top of the boundary layer. Recognition of these features 442 399 raises the question: how does spin up occur in the WISHE 443 400 models in the presence of outflow above the boundary 444 401 layer? We address this question in the next subsection. 445 402

403 2.5.1 Spin up in the WISHE models

It should be noted that the assumption of zero P_m does 449 404 not, by itself, guarantee the material conservation of M_{450} 405 above the boundary layer⁶. In contrast to the classical 451 406 models discussed above, nowhere in the WISHE models 452 407 does the material conservation of M seem to be *imposed* 453 408 above the boundary layer. This is certainly the case in 454 409 the 1997 and 2012 formulations. In these cases, there 455 410 must be a source of M that enables the M-surfaces to 456 411 move inwards above the boundary layer in the presence 457 412 of outflow there. In this sense, the WISHE models cannot 458 413 be considered as physically closed. Whether or not the 459 414 distribution of these sources or sinks is in any sense 460 415 realistic remains an open question and to our knowledge, 461 416 the distribution of the angular momentum source/sink in 462 417 these models has never been shown. In Appendix 1 of 463 418 Smith et al. (2024), it is shown that the material source of 464 419 M may be diagnosed as 420 465

$$\frac{DM}{Dt} = \frac{\partial M}{\partial \theta_e^*} \frac{D\theta_e^*}{Dt} + \left. \frac{\partial M}{\partial t} \right|_{\theta^*}, \qquad (7) \begin{array}{c} {}^{467}_{468} \\ {}^{468}_{468} \end{array}$$

421 once the solution for M and θ_e^* has been determined. 470 422 The material derivative is defined by $D/Dt = \partial/\partial t + 471$ 423 $u\partial/\partial r + w\partial/\partial z$. 472

424 2.5.2 Can one justify the assumption of congruence? $\frac{474}{475}$

Figure 7 shows an azimuthal analysis of the moist isen- 476 425 tropes and M-surfaces taken from a recent idealized, 477 426 three-dimensional, numerical simulation of a tropical 478 427 cyclone life cycle (Smith et al. 2021). This simulation 479 428 is described briefly in Section 4. In particular, the inten- 480 429 sity of the simulated cyclone, characterized here by the 481 430 maximum azimuthally-averaged tangential wind speed, 482 431 V_{max} , is shown in Fig. 9. It is of interest to examine 483 432 at what stage, if any, the azimuthally-averaged M- and 484 433 θ_{e}^{*} -surfaces become appreciably congruent in a simula- 485 434 435 tion that explicitly represents rotating deep convective 486 clouds. Although this would seem to be a reasonable task 487 436 to address, subtleties arise in such an endeavour. 488 437

The air ascending in the developing eyewall of a simulated axisymmetric vortex is necessarily saturated and to a good first approximation, neglecting the effects of subgrid-scale diffusion, θ_e^* is materially conserved. In contrast, in a non-axisymmetric vortex, the air in the developing eyewall is not necessarily saturated at all azimuthal locations at a particular radius. For this reason, an azimuthal average of θ_{e}^{*} seems to be an inappropriate quantity to examine and this average may no longer be materially conserved to as good an approximation as in an axisymmetric configuration. Since in the absence of diffusion, θ_e is materially conserved in both asymmetric and axisymmetric configurations, we would argue that it is the most suitable invariant to assess the possible congruity of M and θ_e in a three-dimensional vortex without ice processes operating.

Figure 7 shows radius-height cross sections of the azimuthally-averaged M- and θ_e -surfaces at 6.5 days, 7.5 days, 8.5 days, 9.5 days, 11 days, and 12.5 days in the life-cycle simulation. Referring to Fig. 9, 6.5 days is about the time when rapid intensification begins. At this stage, congruence is nowhere evident (Fig. 7a). At 7.5 days, which is midway during the period of rapid intensification, the M- and θ_e -surfaces show signs of becoming aligned in the main updraught region in the middle troposphere (Fig. 7b), but not in the lower-tomid troposphere where the highlighted M surfaces cross many θ_e surfaces. Even in the mature stage, at 8.5 and 9.5 days (Figs. 7c,d), congruence is only approximate in this main updraught region and certainly not interior or exterior to this region. At 11 days (Fig. 7e), which is at a stage where the intensity has weakened somewhat (cf. Fig. 9), the main updraught has weakened also and there is little semblance of congruence even in this region. With some re-intensification, at 12.5 days (Fig. 7f), some degree of congruence has become re-established in the main updraught region, but nowhere else. At later times (not shown), the degree of congruence deteriorates, even in the main updraught region.

Evidently, the assumption that the M- and θ_e surfaces are congruent does not hold to a plausible degree during intensification in the three-dimensional configuration. Moreover, at the time when rapid intensification begins (about 6.5 days) there is no degree of congruence whatsoever. Notwithstanding the fact that we have shown the azimuthally-averaged θ_e rather than θ_e^* , these results provide little support for one of the cornerstone assumptions on which the time-dependent WISHE models are based. Further, we are unaware of any other contrary analyses supporting the assumption that the M- and θ_e^* surfaces are globally congruent.

2.5.3 Comparison with observations and numerical simulations

An acid test of any theory is its ability to explain observations and numerical model simulations. The assumed

⁶This is because zero potential vorticity simply implies that the Msurfaces must be always congruent to the saturated equivalent potential temperature surfaces. However, in general, the *M*-surfaces can move relative to the θ_e^* -surfaces. In other words, the congruence assumption implies only that $M = M(\theta_e^*, t)$, where *t* is the time, and is not a function of θ_e^* alone.



Figure 7. Radius-height cross sections of the azimuthally-averaged surfaces of θ_e and M at (a) 6.5 days, (b) 7.5 days, (c) 8.5 days, (d) 9.5 days, (e) 11 days and (f) 12.5 days from the life-cycle simulation to be discussed in Section 4. See Fig. 9 for the stage of each panel during the life cycle. Contour intervals are: θ_e (red) thick contours every 5 K, except between 340 K and 370 K where thin contours are every 2 K. Absolute angular momentum: (black) thin contours every 2×10^5 m² s⁻¹ to 2×10^6 m² s⁻¹, thick contours every 1×10^6 m² s⁻¹. The shaded yellow region shows that of vertical velocity larger than 1 m s⁻¹ and helps delineate the primary, azimuthally-averaged, cloud updraught.

flow configuration of the WISHE models typified by Fig. 498
6, does not appear to capture the elevated maximum of 499
vertical velocity (and mass flux) found in both obser- 500
vations and numerical model simulations of developing 501
storms (e.g., Raymond et al. 2011, Fig. 8; Lussier et al. 502

2014, Fig. 15; Kilroy et al. 2017, Fig. 7b,e,h,k; Montgomery and Persing 2020, Fig. 5b; Smith and Montgomery 2023, Figs. 1.4, 10.7b,d,f,h, Fig. 10.9e, Fig. 10.17a,c,e), nor, judging from Fig. 6, does it appear to capture the corresponding low-level inflow above the

556

557

boundary layer (Kilroy et al. 2017, Fig. 7a,d,g; Smith and
Montgomery 2023, Fig. 10.7a,c,e; Fig10.17b,d,f). The
classical models do not suffer either of these limitations.

Figure 6 indicates that the overturning circulation 506 in the WISHE models extends through the entire depth 507 of the troposphere. Nevertheless, in the real atmosphere 508 and in convection-permitting numerical models, the ver-509 tical extent of convection and the mass flux carried by the 510 convection depends, inter alia, on the degree of convec-511 tive instability. Thus, the ability of convection to ventilate 512 mass converging in the frictional boundary layer of a trop-513 ical cyclone and carry this mass to the upper troposphere 514 cannot be taken for granted (see e.g., Smith and Mont-515 gomery 2023, Section 15.5.4). If the convection is too 516 weak, the mass fraction that cannot be ventilated will flow 517 outwards in a shallow layer above the boundary layer 518 leading to vortex spin down. This process is illustrated 519 also by the classical models (Section 2.4), but will be 520 missed entirely by the overriding assumption that $P_m \equiv 0$ 521 globally. 522

3 A three-dimensional framework

During most of the tropical cyclone life cycle, the flow 524 558 is markedly asymmetric. Only near maturity is the flow 525 550 approximately symmetric and even then only in the 526 560 inner core region, as anticipated by the tendency of 527 the strong differential rotation of the swirling winds to 528 axisymmetrize convectively generated vorticity asymme-529 530 tries there (e.g., Smith and Montgomery 2023, Chapter 4). Under these circumstances, the axisymmetric models 531 562 discussed in Section 2 cannot be expected to apply with-532 563 out modification and an alternative conceptual framework 533 564 is called for. 534 565

Persing et al. (2013) carried out a careful compar-535 566 ison between idealized simulations of tropical cyclones 536 567 simulated in an axisymmetric and three-dimensional con-537 568 figuration, starting from the same axisymmetric initial 538 569 conditions. These authors identified certain fundamental 539 570 differences between vortex evolution in the two experi-540 571 ments as summarized in Smith and Montgomery (2023), 541 572 Section 16.2. An added complication in understanding 542 573 three-dimensional flows is that the material conservation 543 574 of absolute angular momentum above the boundary layer 544 575 cannot be assumed as there are now azimuthal pressure 545 576 gradient forces to induce tangential accelerations. How-546 577 ever a modified approach can be developed using abso-547 578 lute vorticity in conjunction with Stokes' theorem (Smith 548 579 and Montgomery 2023, Chapter 11). This approach is 549 580 described briefly below. 550

551 3.1 The rotating-convection paradigm

The dynamics of the rotating-convection paradigm are encapsulated, in part, by the azimuthal-mean tangential momentum equation, or equivalently by the vertical



Figure 8. Schematic of a region of deep rotating updrafts, with a hypothetical horizontal circuit indicated by a circle. By Stokes' theorem, the relative circulation about the circuit is equal to the areal integral of the relative vorticity enclosed by the circuit. The yellow squiggly arrows indicate moisture fluxes from the ocean. To avoid clutter, the local and system-scale overturning circulations associated with the updraughts and downdraughts are not shown. See text for further discussion. Adapted from Smith and Montgomery (2016).

vorticity equation in conjunction with Stokes' theorem. Stokes' theorem equates the circulation about any fixed closed loop C to the area integral of the vorticity within that loop. Take A to be the area enclosed by loop C and the area to be in a horizontal plane, Stokes' theorem may be written in the form

$$\oint_C \mathbf{V} \cdot d\mathbf{s} = \int \int_A \zeta dA, \tag{8}$$

where V is the velocity vector, ds is a vector increment along the curve C, dA is an area element of A, and ζ is the vertical component of relative vorticity. There is a theorem by Haynes and McIntyre (1987) showing that for the circulation about the circuit C to increase, implying that the mean tangential wind about this circuit increases, vertical vorticity must be brought horizontally into the region across the boundary of C^7 . This statement is the three-dimensional analogue of the idea that for spin up, the *M*-surfaces have to move inwards. It turns out that the *local* enhancement of vertical vorticity by vortexline stretching in convective updraughts totally inside Cdoes not increase the circulation about C because the amplification of vorticity is exactly compensated by the reduced area of the enhanced vorticity.

The horizontal import of vertical vorticity into the circuit C is brought about through advection by the convergent mean overturning circulation produced by the convection within this circuit⁸. As in the axisymmetric case, the convergent mean circulation above the frictional

⁷In general, the change of horizontal circulation occurs via a line integral of a horizontal vorticity flux vector. The flux vector is the sum of an advective and non-advective component (see, e.g., Sections 2.15 and 11.1 of Smith and Montgomery 2023). For simplicity, we focus here primarily on the advective vorticity flux component.

⁸In the general case including both the advective and non-advective vorticity fluxes, the import of cyclonic vorticity by horizontal advection



Figure 9. Time series of the maximum azimuthally-averaged tangential wind speed, Vmax (red), and the radius at which it occurs, Rmax (blue), in the tropical cyclone life cycle simulation described in the text. The figure identifies also the main periods in the life cycle including a gestation phase leading to genesis, the rapid intensification (RI) phase, a first mature phase, a period of temporary decay and re-intensification phase (Temp decay), a second mature phase, a slow decay phase and a rapid decay phase. The yellow shaded regions show approximate times during the life cycle where, *at best*, the WISHE models would be potentially applicable: see text for further discussion of this point.

631

632

633

641

boundary layer has to outweigh the mean divergent 610 581 circulation there due to the boundary layer, itself, in 611 582 order for it to converge net cyclonic vorticity into C. 612 583 An alternative statement is that for the mean tangential 613 584 wind about C to increase, the vertical mass flux being ₆₁₄ 585 carried by the convection within C must be increasing ₆₁₅ 586 with height to ensure, through continuity, radial inflow 616 587 across, assuming of course that there is cyclonic vorticity 617 588 at radii beyond C^9 . 589 618

The rotating-convection paradigm is an outgrowth of 591 the classical axisymmetric models summarized in Section 621 592 2.4, but with some important additions as discussed in 622 593 Smith and Montgomery (2023), Chapter 11. In essence, 594 623 it is a collection of physical principles that provides 595 624 a robust and useful framework for interpreting many 596 625 aspects of tropical cyclone behaviour. Unlike the WISHE 597 models discussed in Section 2.5, it does not provide an $_{627}$ 598 analytical theory, but the physical principles on which 628 599 it is based are generally applicable to understanding the $_{629}$ 600 complete life cycle of storms. 601 630

4 The tropical cyclone life cycle

634 In a recent paper, Smith et al. (2021) carried out an ideal-603 ized, 20-day, cloud-permitting, three-dimensional numer-604 636 ical model simulation of the tropical cyclone life cycle 605 in a quiescent environment. The life cycle begins with 637 606 a period of gestation leading to genesis and ends with a 638 607 608 period of rapid decay. The simulation starts with a rel- 639 atively weak initial vortex with a maximum tangential 640 609

wind speed of only 5 m s⁻¹ at the surface at a radius of 200 km. This vortex is axisymmetric, cloud-free and in thermal wind balance. The thermodynamic sounding at large radius is based on the composite moist Atlantic sounding of Dunion (2011). Major features of the simulation are summarized in Chapter 15 of Smith and Montgomery (2023).

The evolution of the maximum azimuthallyaveraged tangential wind speed (Vmax) from this simulation and the radius at which it occurs (Rmax) are shown in Fig. 9. The figure shows also the period where, at best, the *M*- and θ_e -surfaces are sufficiently congruent in the eyewall region of the vortex that the WISHE models might be conceivably invoked to explain the vortex evolution. This is notwithstanding some unrealistic aspects of these models discussed in Section 2.5.3. In contrast, Smith et al. showed that the rotating-convection paradigm provides a useful framework for understanding much of the vortex behaviour during the entire life cycle. A central idea in this framework is the appreciation that the strength of deep overturning circulation induced by deep convection and the strength of the boundary layer inflow that supplies moist air to the convection are controlled by separate processes. Specifically, the ability of deep convection to ventilate mass to the upper troposphere at the rate that mass converges in the boundary layer cannot be taken for granted (Fig. 10a).

During the genesis and rapid intensification stages of vortex evolution, the mass flux supplied by the frictional boundary layer to the inner core region of the vortex is outweighed by the mass flux carried upwards by the collective effects of deep convection (Fig. 10b). As a result, the convectively-induced inflow in the lower part of the troposphere above the frictional boundary layer is strong enough to reverse the shallow layer of outflow that would otherwise be induced by the boundary layer (see e.g., Section 2.3.3). During these stages, the boundary

590

occurs in combination with the generation of cyclonic vorticity (or a destruction of anticyclonic vorticity) associated with the horizontal non-advective flux within the circuit.

⁹When integrated with height from the boundary layer top, this idea forms the basis for the ventilation index introduced by Smith et al. 645 (2021). 646

layer is rapidly moistened by surface evaporation, the 703
moistening being sufficient to maintain deep convective 704
instability. In turn, moist convection in the core leads 705
to a moistening of the vortex core region aloft, thereby 706
reducing the strength of convective downdraughts in the 707
core that would otherwise act to stabilize the boundary 708
layer to further convection. 709

As the vortex matures, however, the inner core 710 654 boundary layer comes closer to saturation, reducing the 711 655 continued flux of surface moisture supply to maintain 712 656 convective instability, whereas the upper levels of the vor-⁷¹³ 657 tex warm, a natural consequence of balance dynamics 714 658 (e.g., Smith and Montgomery (2023), Section 5.3). The ⁷¹⁵ 659 716 upper-level warming has a stabilizing effect on inner-core 660 717 deep convection and gradually gains the upper hand. As 661 a result, the collective effects of deep convection become ⁷¹⁸ 662 719 progressively less able to ventilate mass at the rate that 663 720 mass is supplied by the boundary layer. This inability 664 721 is enhanced by the increase in the boundary-layer mass 665 722 flux as the vortex intensifies and broadens. The broaden-666 723 ing is reflected, in part, by the progressive increase in the 667 724 radius of maximum tangential wind speed shown in Fig. 668 725 9 as well as the increase in the radius of gales (see Smith 669 726 et al. 2021, Fig. 1c). The broadening is, itself, a conse-670 quence of continued lower-tropospheric inflow above the 671 boundary layer. Eventually, a situation is reached where 727 672 convection is no longer able to ventilate all the mass con-673 verging in the boundary layer and the fraction that cannot 674 729 be ventilated flows outwards in a shallow layer above the 675 730 boundary layer (Fig. 10c). When this happens, the tan-676 731 gential wind spins down locally, as in the friction only 677 732 calculation discussed in Section 2.3.3, and the boundary 678 733 layer flow weakens in response. 679 734

In the Smith et al. simulation, the processes 680 735 described above account also for the temporary decay 681 736 and subsequent re-intensification of the vortex between 682 737 about $9\frac{1}{2}$ and 12 days. The decay is accompanied by a 683 738 weakening of the mass flux carried by the inner eyewall 684 730 convection and the resulting low-level outflow triggers 685 740 a band of deep convection at larger radii. Subsequently, 686 741 a new eyewall cloud forms at a larger radius than the 687 742 original eyewall, but inside the band of deep convection. 688 743 The re-intensification is accompanied by this new eye-689 744 wall formation and the convection beyond it progressively $_{\rm 745}$ 690 decays. 691 746

The foregoing processes are broadly analogous to 747 692 reducing the bubbling rate in the Turner-Lilly bubbling 748 693 experiment, suitably modified for tropical cyclones as 749 694 described in Section 2.2.1. One could imagine first reduc- 750 695 ing the bubbling rate from a ring of bubbling tubes and 751 696 then increasing the rate while increasing the radius of 752 697 the bubbling tubes. The additional effect in the forego-753 698 ing numerical simulation is the stable stratification of the 754 699 model atmosphere, which confines the unventilated radial 755 700 outflow from the boundary layer to a shallow layer just 756 701 above the boundary layer. 757 702

As time proceeds in the life-cycle simulation, the same sequence of events accounts for the slow decay from about 13 to 18 days. The rapid decay after 18 days is accompanied by the rapid collapse of any deep convection and the occurrence of radial outflow through the entire troposphere.

Referring to the time series of Vmax in Fig. 9, it is clear from the ventilation ideas encapsulated in Fig. 10 that rapid intensification would take place in conditions where the deep convective mass flux averaged over the inner-core region significantly exceeds the rate at which mass is supplied to this region by the boundary layer. These conditions would lead to the largest inflow velocity above the boundary layer and thereby the largest inward advection of the M-surfaces. Thus, there is no intrinsic difference in the physical mechanisms involved between intensification and rapid intensification, only the relative magnitudes of the key processes. Recognition of this fact would seem to offer the potential for the construction of a simple diagnostic tool derivable from forecast models that could help to anticipate periods of rapid intensification, such as the ventilation parameter introduced in Section 15.5.4 of Smith and Montgomery (2023).

4.1 Applicability of WISHE models?

While the rotating-convection paradigm provides a framework for interpreting the physics of vortex evolution in the foregoing life-cycle simulation, the individual processes involved are coupled nonlinearly and it is not possible to isolate them: one is forced to solve the problem numerically. The processes leading to spin up during the period of rapid intensification are essentially those captured by the classical models summarized in Section 2.4: i.e., vortex spin up is principally a result of the inward advection of the azimuthallyaveraged M-surfaces in the lower tropospheric branch of the overturning circulation above the frictional boundary layer where the azimuthally-averaged M is approximately materially conserved. These processes, in conjunction with the accompanying boundary layer dynamics and thermodynamics, account also for the tendency of the azimuthally-averaged M- and θ_e -surfaces to become approximately congruent as the vortex matures. This tendency would be expected if air parcels rising into the eyewall approximately conserve the values of M and θ_e with which they left the boundary layer. Obviously, in regions where the air is saturated at every azimumth, the θ_e -surfaces will coincide with those of θ_e^* . However, if ice processes are modelled, pseudo-adiabatic θ_e conservation cannot be assumed when the clouds glaciate in the upper troposphere.

It would seem to be against causality to postulate that, when a sufficient degree of congruence between M and θ_e is achieved in the eyewall, this congruence becomes the key constraint *globally* and the material



Figure 10. (a) Depiction of the azimuthally-averaged overturning circulations induced by deep convection (in blue) and by the frictional boundary layer (in red). The collective effects of deep convection is to produce inflow in the lower troposphere, above and within the frictional boundary layer, in part by entrainment. The boundary layer top is indicated by the thin horizontal dashed line. In contrast, the boundary layer leads to inflow within it and outflow in a shallow layer above it as exemplified by the balance calculation in Fig. 5. The ability of deep convection to ventilate mass to the upper troposphere at the rate mass converges in the boundary layer cannot be taken for granted. In general, there are two scenarios illustrated in (b) and (c). In these panels, the green curvy arrows symbolize surface enthalpy fluxes, which are largest in the intensification stage of development. In (b), the net upward mass flux carried by convection in a cylindrical region of radius *R* exceeds the mass flux entering this cylinder in the boundary layer, whereupon, through continuity, there must be inflow in the lower troposphere above the boundary layer. This situation is most pronounced in the genesis and rapid intensification phases of the vortex life cycle. It is the inflow above the boundary layer exceeds the net upward mass flux carried by deep convection leading to outflow in the lower troposphere above the boundary layer. This situation becomes progressively established in the mature and decay phases of the vortex life cycle. The outflow above the boundary layer carries absolute momentum surfaces outwards leading to spin down above the boundary layer.

conservation of M above the boundary layer can be 763 dispensed with (cf. Subsection 2.5.1). This would seem 764 to be exactly what the WISHE models are doing to 765 build a theory for the subsequent evolution of the vortex. It is the authors' view that, despite the mathematical

elegance of these models, they are of questionable utility for understanding most, if not all aspects of the tropical cyclone life cycle.

766 **5** Conclusions

823 We have examined possible conceptual frameworks, both 824 767 axisymmetric and three-dimensional, for understanding 825 768 the physics of the tropical cyclone life cycle in an ide-769 alized, three-dimensional, numerical simulation in a qui- 827 770 escent environment. We suggest that an essential element 828 771 of any axisymmetric framework should be the assump-772 tion that absolute angular momentum is materially con-829 773 served above the frictional boundary layer. Such conser-⁸³⁰ 774 831 vation implies that vortex spin up requires radial inflow 775 above the friction layer, while radial outflow there leads to 832 776 spin down. We showed that, with this assumption, many 833 777 aspects of vortex behaviour in an axisymmetric frame-778 work may be illustrated by two simple laboratory experi-779 ments. 780

We noted that, in the widely popular axisymmet-781 835 ric WISHE models, the material conservation of absolute 782 836 angular momentum is disregarded in favour of assum-783 837 ing that the saturated moist equivalent potential vorticity 784 838 is everywhere zero, or equivalently that the surfaces of 785 absolute angular momentum and saturation moist equiv- 839 786 alent potential temperature (or, equivalently, saturation 840 787 moist entropy) are congruent globally at all times. Evi- 841 788 dence is presented showing that, at best, this assumption 789 would limit the applicability of the WISHE models to a 842 790 small fraction of the tropical cyclone life cycle. However, 843 791 our analysis of a recent three-dimensional numerical sim-844 792 ulation examining the tropical cyclone life cycle unveils 793 845 a causality problem with assuming that global congru-794 846 ence controls vortex evolution. In particular, dispensing 795 with the implementation of the material conservation of 847 796 absolute angular momentum allows for the occurrence of 848 797 sources or sinks of this quantity and these may be non-798 849 physical. 799

Because of differences in behaviour between the 850 800 851 dynamics of convective rings and locally rotating-801 852 convective updraughts, the three-dimensional framework 802 is ultimately the proper framework for understanding 803 the tropical cyclone life cycle. We showed that, in this 804 854 framework, the rotating-convection paradigm provides an 805 855 understanding of much of the vortex behaviour during 806 the tropical cyclone life cycle. Like the classical Eliassen 856 807 model, it highlights the importance for vortex spin up 857 808 of the deep, convectively-induced overturning circula- 858 809 tion being strong enough to generate inflow above the 810 859 frictional boundary layer in the presence of the ubiqui-811 860 tous tendency of the boundary layer to generate outflow 812 there. When deep convection is too weak to ventilate all ⁸⁶¹ 813 the mass that is converging in the boundary layer to the 814 862 upper troposphere, there is net outflow above the bound-815 863 ary layer and the vortex weakens. This behaviour appears 816 864 to be ruled out in the WISHE models by their overriding 817 865 assumption of global moist neutrality, but is a feature of 818 the classical Eliassen model. 819 866

Finally, the ventilation ideas discussed in Section 867 821 4 suggest that there is no intrinsic difference in the 868

dynamics of tropical cyclone intensification and that of rapid intensification. Moreover, we pointed out that these ideas offer potential for the construction of a diagnostic tool derivable from forecast models that could help to anticipate periods of rapid intensification.

Acknowledgements

We thank Michael Reeder and an anonymous reviewer for their perceptive comments on the first version of the manuscript. The views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not represent sponsoring agencies or institutions.

References

- Bui, H. H., R. K. Smith, M. T. Montgomery, and J. Peng, 2009: Balanced and unbalanced aspects of tropicalcyclone intensification. *Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc.*, **135**, 1715–1731.
- Dunion, J. P., 2011: Rewriting the climatology of the tropical north atlantic and caribbean sea atmosphere. J. Clim., 24, 893–908.
- Eliassen, A., 1951: Slow thermally or frictionally controlled meridional circulation in a circular vortex. *Astrophys. Norv.*, **5**, 19–60.
- Eliassen, A., 1962: On the vertical circulations in frontal zones. *Geofys. Publ.*, **24**, 147–160.
- Emanuel, K. A., 1989: The finite-amplitude nature of tropical cyclogenesis. J. Atmos. Sci., 46, 3431–3456.
- Emanuel, K. A., 1995: The behavior of a simple hurricane model using a convective scheme based on subcloudlayer entropy equilibrium. J. Atmos. Sci., 52, 3960– 3968.
- Emanuel, K. A., 1997: Some aspects of hurricane innercore dynamics and energetics. J. Atmos. Sci., 54, 1014– 1026.
- Emanuel, K. A., 2000: *Quasi-equilibrium thinking, In: General Circulation Model Development, Ed. D. A. Randall.* Academic Press, NewYork, 225–255 pp.
- Emanuel, K. A., 2012: Self-stratification of tropical cyclone outflow. Part II: Implications for storm intensification. J. Atmos. Sci., 69, 988–996.
- Haynes, P., and M. E. McIntyre, 1987: On the evolution of vorticity and potential vorticity in the presence of diabatic heating and frictional or other forces. *J. Atmos. Sci.*, 44, 828–841.
- Kilroy, G., R. K. Smith, and M. T. Montgomery, 2017: A unified view of tropical cyclogenesis and intensification. *Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc.*, 143, 450–462.

923

941

944

947

- 14
- Lussier, L., M. T. Montgomery, and M. M. Bell, 2014: 916 869 The genesis of Typhoon Nuri as observed during the 917 870
- Tropical Cyclone Structure 2008 (TCS-08) field exper-871
- 918 iment - Part 3: Dynamics of low-level spin-up during 872 919
- the genesis. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 14, 8795-8812. 873
- Montgomery, M. T., M. E. Nichols, T. A. Cram, and A. B. 874
- 921 Saunders, 2006: A vortical hot tower route to tropical 875 922 cyclogenesis. J. Atmos. Sci., 63, 355-386.
- 876
- Montgomery, M. T., and J. Persing, 2020: Does balance 924 877 dynamics well capture the secondary circulation and 878
- 925 spinup of a simulated hurricane? J. Atmos. Sci., 78, 75-879 926
- 880 95. 927
- 928 Morton, B. R., 1966: Geophysical vortices, In Prog. In 88
- Aeronautical Sci., Ed. Küchemann, Vol. 7. Pergamon, 882 929 145-194 pp. 883 930
- 931 Ooyama, K. V., 1982: Conceptual evolution of the theory 884 and modeling of the tropical cyclone. J. Meteor. Soc. 885
- 932 Japan, 60, 369-380. 886 933
- 934 Persing, J., M. T. Montgomery, J. McWilliams, and R. K. 887 935
- Smith, 2013: Asymmetric and axisymmetric dynamics 888 of tropical cyclones. Atmos. Chem. Phys., 13, 12299-889 936 12341. 890 937
- 938 Raymond, D. J., S. Sessions, and C. Lopez-Carillo, 2011: 891 939
- Thermodynamics of tropical cyclogenesis in the north-892 west Pacific. J. Geophys. Research, 116, 1-18. 893 940
- Schubert, W. H., and B. T. Alworth, 1982: Evolution of 894 942 potential vorticity in tropical cyclones. Quart. Journ. 943 895 Roy. Meteor. Soc., 39, 1687-1697. 896
- Schubert, W. H., and J. J. Hack, 1982: Inertial stability 897 945 and tropical cyclone development. J. Atmos. Sci., 39, 898 946 1687-1697. 899
- Schubert, W. H., and J. J. Hack, 1983: Transformed 948 900 Eliassen balanced vortex model. J. Atmos. Sci., 40, 949 901 1571-1583. 902 950
- Shapiro, L. J., and H. Willoughby, 1982: The response 951 903 of balanced hurricanes to local sources of heat and 952 904 momentum. J. Atmos. Sci., 39, 378-394. 953 905 954
- Smith, R. K., G. Kilroy, and M. T. Montgomery, 2014: 906 Why do model tropical cyclones intensify more rapidly 907 at low latitudes? J. Atmos. Sci., 140, 1783-1804. 908
- Smith, R. K., G. Kilroy, and M. T. Montgomery, 2021: 909 Tropical cyclone life cycle in a three-dimensional 910 numerical simulation. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 911
- 147.3373-3393. 912
- Smith, R. K., and L. M. Leslie, 1976: Thermally driven 913 vortices: a numerical study with application to dust 914 devils. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 102, 791-804. 915

- Smith, R. K., and M. T. Montgomery, 2016: Understanding hurricanes. Weather, 71, 219–223.
- Smith, R. K., and M. T. Montgomery, 2023: Tropical cyclones: Observations and basic processes. Elsevier, London, 411pp.
- Smith, R. K., M. T. Montgomery, and H. Bui, 2018: Axisymmetric balance dynamics of tropical cyclone intensification and its breakdown revisited. J. Atmos. Sci., 75, 3169-3189.
- Smith, R. K., M. T. Montgomery, and S. Wang, 2024: Can one reconcile the classical theories and the WISHEtheories of tropical cyclone intensification? Tropical Cyclone Research and Review, 13, In review.
- Turner, J. S., and D. K. Lilly, 1963: The carbonated-water tornado vortex. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 20, 468-471.
- Črnivec, N., R. K. Smith, and G. Kilroy, 2015: Dependence of tropical cyclone intensification rate on sea surface temperature. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 140, 1618–1627.
- Wang, S., M. T. Montgomery, and R. K. Smith, 2021: Solutions of the Eliassen balance equation for inertially and/or symmetrically stable and unstable vortices. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 145, 2760-2771.
- Wang, S., and R. K. Smith, 2019: Consequences of regularizing the Sawyer-Eliassen equation in balance models for tropical cyclone behaviour. Quart. Journ. Roy. Meteor. Soc., 145, 3766–3779.
- Willoughby, H. E., 1979: Forced secondary circulations in hurricanes. J. Geophys. Res., 84, 3173-3183.
- Zhang, J. A., D. S. Nolan, R. F. Rogers, and V. Tallapragada, 2015: Evaluating the impact of improvments in the boundary layer parameterization on hurricane intensity and structure forecasts in HWRF. Mon. Wea. Rev., 143, 3136 - 3155.
- Zhu, P., A. Hazelton, Z. Zhang, F. D. Marks, and V. Tallapragada, 2021: The role of eyewall turbulent transport in the pathway to intensification of tropical cyclones. J. Geophys. Res. Atmospheres, 126, 1-26.